

SHORT FORM ORDER

SUPREME COURT: STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NASSAU

PRESENT:

HON. IRA B. WARSHAWSKY,

Justice.

TRIAL/IAS PART 10

ALFONSO AMORIZZO, CHARLES CHIN-SANG, EDMUND CHIN-SANG, GREGORY CONNORS. JOHN DELAHANTY, PETER DILL, RAYMOND DODGE, ROBERT DODGE, NEIL R. DOHREN, VANESSA ESPEJO, ESTATES HOME DELIVERY, LTD., JAMES FRAZZITTA, LAURENCE FURNELL, CHARLES HAGEMEYER, CAROL HAZELDINE, JUSTIAN A. NICKMICK OF TIME, INC., MAKO ASSOCIATES, INC., SAME MARTINEZ, DIANE McDONALD d/b/a DIANE M. McDONALD ENTERPRISES, JAMES McMULLEN, MICHAEL RANDANO, REIN DISTRIBUTION, INC., KEITH J. RUMM, GARY SPIERER, CAROL-ANNE STAUER, TJ'S PARTY TENTS, INC., TOP DOG DELIVERY SERVICE, INC., LEN TORCHIN, JOSEPH VETRO, MARK VON WIEDING, MAREK WADOLOWSKI, WDC, INC., RHONDA ZELKIIND, VINCENT ROMANO, On Behalf of Themselves and On Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated.

Plaintiffs,

INDEX NO.: 012200/2005 MOTION DATE: 10/17/2008

MOTION SEQUENCE: 006 and 007

-against-

ANTHONY CONTE, ANTHONY CONTE d/b/a I-MEDIA CORPORATION, ANTHONY CONTE d/b/a I MEDIA, ANTHONY CONTE d/b/a IMEDIA CORPORATION, ANTHONY CONTE d/b/a IMEDIA CORPORATION, ANTHONY CONTE d/b/a AMERICAN HOME TV TIME MAGAZINE, ANTHONY CONTE d/b/a AMERICAN HOME DISTRIBUTION NETWORK,

Defendants.

Third-Party Plaintiff,

-against-

COUNTY OF NASSAU, NEW YORK NASSAU COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE, DENIS E. DILLON, Individually and as Former District Attorney of Nassau County, New York, BOB EMMONS, Individually and as Assistant District Attorney of Nassau County, New York, PHILIP WASILAUSKY, Individually and as Assistant District Attorney of Nassau County, New York, WILLIAM WALLACE, Individually and as Assistant District Attorney of Nassau County, New York, MIKE FALZARANO, Individually and as Special Investigator for the Office of the District Attorney of Nassau County, New York, TEFTA SHASKA, Individually and as a Detective for the Police Department of the City of New York, LISA BLAND, Individually and as attorney for the Police Department of the City of New York, ROBERT VINAL, Individually and as Deputy Commissioner for the Police Department of the City of New York, THE CITY OF NEW YORK, THE POLICE DEPARTMENT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK. LARRY GUERRA, MARK HARRINGTON, NEWSDAY, INC., "JOHN" AND "JANE" DOES, 1-30, Individuals and Business Entities, CONSUMERS WAREHOUSE CENTER, INC., JAMES S. BALOGA, SR., JAMES S. BALOGA, JR., MARIO ESCAMILLA,

Third-Party Defendants.

The following papers read on this motion:

Notice of Motion, Affidavit & Exhibits Annexed	1
Notice of Motion, Affidavit & Exhibits Annexed	2

Respective motions by third-party defendants Larry Guerra and by Tefta Shaska, individually and as a detective in the Police Department of the City of New York, to dismiss the third-party complaint as to said third-party defendants are granted pursuant to CPLR 3211(a)(4).

The claims asserted against Larry Guerra and Tefta Shaska in the third-party complaint herein are basically identical to those asserted by defendant/third-party plaintiff Anthony Conte in the second amended complaint filed in the federal action commenced by him in the United States District Court: Eastern District of New York under case no. 06-CV-4746 (JFB-ETB).

With respect to Larry Guerra and Tefta Shaska, both the third-party complaint and the federal complaint (second amended complaint) allege, *inter alia*, that Larry Guerra, who signed a route distribution agreement with Anthony Conte's company, I Media Corporation, breached that agreement by failing to make the final payment of \$4,500 due in February, 2004. As a result, defendant/third-party plaintiff advised Mr. Guerra that the agreement was terminated and the \$4,500 previously paid by him would be retained as liquidated damages. In response, Anthony Conte alleges that Guerra, in an effort to recoup his money, falsely alleged, in a small claims action brought to recoup the \$4500, that Conte's publishing business was illegitimate and a fraud.

With respect to Tefta Shaska, defendant/third-party plaintiff alleges, *inter alia*, that she commenced an investigation of Mr. Conte, and used her position as a New York City Police detective to obtain private documents regarding I Media Corporation and made false and defamatory allegations [that Conte and I Media Corporation had committed fraud and were illegitimate] to several route distributors and a printer with whom I Media Corporation did business.

Courts possess broad discretion to dismiss an action predicated on the grounds of a prior pending action where, as here, there is substantial identity of the parties and causes of action and both suits arise out of the same subject matter or series of alleged wrongs. *Fischer v RWSP Realty, LLC*, 53 AD3d 594, 595 [2nd Dept. 2008]; *Coppa v Fabozzi*, 5 AD3d 718 [2nd Dept.

2004]. As a general matter, deference is accorded to the first action filed, (*Reckson Associates Realty Corp. v Blasland, Bouck & Lee, Inc.*, 230 AD2d 723, 725 [2nd Dept. 1996]), and no reason has been shown why the court should depart from that rule here. In fact, defendant/third-party plaintiff Anthony Conte has offered no opposition to the dismissal motions which are hereby granted pursuant to CPLR 3211(a)(4). Now, therefore, it is

ORDERED that the third-party complaint is dismissed against Larry Guerra and Tefta Shaska.

Dated: December 1, 2008

ENTERED

DEC 03 2008

NASSAU COUNTY COUNTY CLERK'S OFFICE